Comparative Analysis on the Integration of Strategic Environments in the Retail Sector from the Perspective of Innovation Management

Fabio Santo Caram  
Student of the Professional Master's Program in Management and Technology in Production Systems  
State Center for Technological Education Paula Souza - CEETEPS - Postgraduate, Extension and Research Unit - São Paulo, Brazil  
Email: fabio.caram@cpspos.sp.gov.br

Rosinei Batista Ribeiro  
Professor of the Professional Master's Program in Management and Technology in Production Systems  
State Center for Technological Education Paula Souza - CEETEPS - Postgraduate, Extension and Research Unit - São Paulo, Brazil  
Teresa D'Ávila University Center - UNIFATEA - Lorena, SP, Brazil  
São Paulo State Faculty of Technology - FATEC - Cruzeiro Unit, SP, Brazil  
Technological Institute of Aeronautics - DCTA - São José dos Campos, SP, Brazil  
Email: rosinei.ribeiro@cpspos.sp.gov.br

Eliane Antonio Simões  
Professor of the Professional Master's Program in Management and Technology in Production Systems  
State Center for Technological Education Paula Souza - CEETEPS - Postgraduate, Extension and Research Unit - São Paulo, Brazil  
Email: eliane.simoes@cpspos.sp.gov.br

Alexandre Formigoni  
Professor of the Professional Master's Program in Management and Technology in Production Systems  
State Center for Technological Education Paula Souza - CEETEPS - Postgraduate, Extension and Research Unit - São Paulo, Brazil  
Email: alexandre.formigoni@cpspos.sp.gov.br

Érik Leonel Luciano  
Student of the Professional Master's Program in Management and Technology in Production Systems  
State Center for Technological Education Paula Souza - CEETEPS - Postgraduate, Extension and Research Unit - São Paulo, Brazil  
Email: erik.luciano@cpspos.sp.gov.br

Caio Fernando da Silva  
Graduate Student in Design  
Teresa D'Ávila University Center - UNIFATEA - Lorena, SP, Brazil  
Email: nandosilvapqi@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

The changes in the consumer profile make more and more retailers incorporate innovative strategies to boost and maintain high performance in the market. With this focus, this work seeks to answer the following research question: Would it be possible to identify which innovations are adopted by the two largest retailers in Brazil in order to enable implementation in small and medium-sized companies? The objective is to comparatively analyze the integration of strategic environments in the retail sector of these two retailers from the perspective of innovation management, specifically to describe the innovations implemented, analyzed and compared from the perspective of Innovation Management and Strategic Management. As a methodology, it was adopted as a strategy to carry out a systematic literature review in order to create a solid scientific theoretical basis and a case study of two retail chains analyzing and comparing the innovations that were implemented. The results showed the importance that retail has for consumers, companies, society and the country's economy and showed an increase in sales through the online system in billing, reduction in operations and diversification in the commercialization of products, contributing to the management of the chain, supply and sustainability.

Keywords: Competitiveness in Retail, Consumer Experience, Innovation Management, Multichannel, Omnichannel.

1. Introduction

The changes in the profile of consumers are causing more and more retailers to incorporate innovative strategies to stay in the market that is becoming increasingly competitive (Brynjolfsson, Hu, Rahman, 2013). One of these strategies that has been highlighted is to offer different services/service and sales channels to customers, a concept called multichannel marketing (Lionello, Slongo, & Alba, 2013).
For Motta e Silva (2006), the evolution of the internet has transformed the profiles of competition in business, especially in the retail sector. The digital revolution has promoted changes in the concept of space, time and mass, making it possible to create online retail available anywhere and at any time.

The research problem arises from realizing that the Brazilian retail has been losing sales, acting only with the physical marketing system and increasing the operational cost, with an increase in the effective contingent and even in the issuance of papers such as invoices, guarantees that can be sent online through emails, whatsapp, among other ways.

The methodology of this work was based on two ramifications, the first in the construction of a theoretical framework through the detailed analysis of national and international articles, in order to list what the main theorists describe and justify about the concepts of competitiveness, innovation, multichannel, Omnichannel, highlighting the six most relevant articles on the subject, taking into account the number of citations, their area of study, their title, keywords and abstract, using the Narrative Literature Review.

In the second stage, the execution of a Case Study, analyzing the two largest retail chains in the country, separating them into two major areas, which stand out: Supermarket and Clothing, focusing on describing which innovations were implemented, analyzing and comparing under the perspective of Innovation Management.

Finally, this article aims to comparatively analyze the integration of strategic environments in the retail sector from the perspective of innovation management, specifically to describe the innovations implemented, analyzed and compared from the perspective of Innovation Management and Strategic Management.

2. Literature Review
2.1. Innovation Management

Companies understood that inserting innovation and being committed to its development process results not only in the possibility of maintaining competitive positions already achieved, but also in surviving in more turbulent spaces (LAWSON; SAMSON, 2001). Innovation is associated with the increasingly shorter life cycle of products and in global and competitive markets, in which competition for customers is fierce (CORAL et al., 2009).

According to Tidd, Bessant and Pavitt (2005), innovation management can be carried out in four phases. Sequencing of Phases (prospecting, strategic selection, mobilization of knowledge and skills and implementation) in Innovation Management.

Phase 1 (Prospecting), Consists of monitoring the internal and external environment to detect signs of potential changes that could affect the business. Phase 2 (Strategic Selection), It seeks to choose among the existing options, the one that best presents technological and market signals, based on the company's resources and capabilities. Phase 3 (Mobilization of Knowledge and Skills) In which resources and capabilities that the company already has and that it needs to be evaluated are evaluated, in addition to the challenge of determining how these resources could be used strategically.

Phase 4 (Implementation), It consists of putting the innovation project into practice, arising from various stages of development of ideas and concepts until the final launch of the product or service to the market.

For Quadros (2008), the difficulty in systematizing innovation can become even greater when working with small and medium-sized companies, considering their limitations of structure and resources. According to Las Casas (2004), retail is the commercial activity responsible for providing goods and services desired by consumers.

Kotler (2012) defined the retail market as “All activities relating to the sale of goods and services directly to the final consumer, for personal and non-commercial use, are involved in retail. Cobra (1997) exemplifies retail as every business unit that buys goods from manufacturers, wholesalers and other distributors and sells directly to final consumers, adopting marketing strategies that must be put into practice by sales management.

According to Morgado (2008), it is the need to serve consumers that drives innovation in retail. Araújo (2017) explains that almost everything today is a service, and the consumer is not only looking for the product, but also for an experience and, for that, good communication is necessary. He also emphasizes that innovating in retail has become a matter of survival for companies.

Levy and Weitz (2009) state that multichannel retailing is the sale of products or services to end consumers in more than one type of channel. For Zhang et al. (2010) the multichannel strategy can start in any channel, with or without a store.

Multichannel retail is defined as a strategy of distributing different channels to serve the consumer who uses more than one sales channel, such as online offline sales (Stone, Hobbs & Kahleeli, 2002). Multichannel retail has been used as a market insertion strategy by Brazilian companies operating in electronic retail, through the sale of products and services in multiple digital channels (Porto, 2006).

In the words of Verhoef et al. (2015) omnichannel is “the synergistic management of the various available sales channels and customer touch points, so that the customer experience across channels and their overall performance are optimized.” According to Guissoni (2017), he states that a company that has omnichannel as a strategy has advantages in sales compared to those that work only with physical stores.
A publication by ILOS (2015) shows the customer at the center of this strategy, as shown in figure 1. It demonstrates that, through the various shopping options, the customer can choose the one that suits them at the moment without having to have only the option to purchase a product, having to go to the physical store, and that the existence of different channels significantly reduces the limitations found in one or another channel, that is, it has several purchase options and not just a single acquisition channel.

Figure 1. Schematic of Omnichannel Management over Multichannel. Source: ILOS (2015).

Currently, another omnichannel trend is to bring “webrooming” to the physical store, using sensor technologies that communicate machine-to-machine to track the customer's journey inside the store (Kotler; Kartajava; Setiawan, 2016).

This means that through applications, QRcodes, barcodes, the customer himself can select the chosen products, separate them in a digital cart and in the application itself finalize their purchase, being inside the physical store, but without queuing at the Cashier.

Carvalho (2019), through Figure 2, exemplifies two situations that can occur called showrooming and webrooming. In showrooming, it is characterized by the action of the customer in analyzing the product of interest in the physical store and making the purchase in the online environment and webrooming, which is characterized by the search and analysis of the product in the online environment and the execution of the purchase in the offline environment. Both scenarios are within the omnichannel system.

Webrooming is when you go online to research a product, but then go into a store to buy it. Showrooming is the demonstration in the physical store where the customer can choose, evaluate and try the products, but finalize the purchase through online.

3. Methodology

The methodology of this work was based on two stages, in the first on the detailed analysis of national and international articles, using the Narrative Review of Literature and case study and in the second stage, on a case study, analyzing the two largest retailers in the country separating them into two major areas, namely: Supermarkets and Clothing. The focus will be to discuss the dimensions of Integration in their business strategies and the innovation perspective of the two cases.

3.1. Narrative Review of Literature - NRL

Cordeiro et al., (2007), define that the narrative review is considered a traditional or exploratory review, where there is no definition of explicit criteria and the selection of articles is made arbitrarily, not following a systematic, in which the author you can include documents according to your bias, so there is no concern about exhausting the sources of information.

Vosgerau and Romanowsk (2014) explain that the RNL is constituted by a broad analysis of the literature, without establishing a rigorous methodology.

3.2. Case Study

The two case studies are based on analyzing and bringing to the market the innovation strategies used by two large retailers, the first in the supermarket business, the second in the clothing segment.

All have the characteristics of operating both in the physical and virtual system through e-commerce and integrated logistics platforms, multichannel and omnichannel.

Case study is also seen as a research strategy that allows the researcher to build their own paths and adjust their methodological design in pursuit of the proposed objectives (CLEMENTE JR, 2012). For Yin (2001), the case study should be composed of four sections, Table 1.

Table 1. Composition of the Protocol for the Case Study.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Section Section Content</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Case Study Project Overview</td>
<td>• Project objectives and sponsorships.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Case study questions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Important readings on the topic being investigated.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Field Procedures</td>
<td>• Credentials and access to case study locations.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
In 1948, Valentim dos Santos Diniz opens the Pão de Açúcar Doceira in São Paulo. The name is a tribute to the country that welcomed it. In 1959, the first store of the Pão de Açúcar chain was opened. 30 years later, Extra stores were created to compete in the hypermarkets area. With all this, the first Brazilian retail ombudsman was born. In 1999, the Casino Group acquires a relevant stake of 25% of the company’s total capital. In 2000 all the Group's online services were consolidated into a single website and in 2014 the Clube Extra loyalty program was created. Launch of Minuto Pão de Açúcar and creation of Cnova, which are the group's online sales channels.

In 2016, the GPA group is ranked second in the ranking of the best places to work. Unparalleled discounts are offered in the market, the network is heavily involved in social networks and the group becomes the TOP VOICE market. In 2018, the group celebrates its 70th anniversary and in 2021 it launches GPA LOG, a Group logistics company that started to offer services to marketplace sellers, ensuring fast deliveries, competitive freight and order traceability. (RI – GPA, 2022).

3.2.2. Renner Shops®

In 1922, it was as part of the A. J. Renner group, a factory located in the Navegantes neighborhood, in Porto Alegre (RS), that Renner opened its first point of sale for the sale of textile articles in the capital of Rio Grande do Sul in the same year. After 18 years, in 1940, still as a company belonging to the group, the product mix was expanded and it started to operate as a department store. In 1965, the company Lojas Renner S.A. was created. and marks the birth of the network as it is known today.

In 1990 it began operating in the format of a department store specializing in fashion, totaling eight operations. Implementation of the Philosophy of Enchantment – according to which it is not enough to satisfy, but to exceed the expectations of customers and that's how the slogan was born, thus the slogan "You have your style. Renner has them all." In 2002, the products began to be displayed in a coordinated manner, grouping clothes, shoes and accessories into six own brands that reflect lifestyles, facilitating customer choice and optimizing their shopping time.

In 2014, the group launched the Sustainable Renner Project with strong investment in technology and innovation in retail sales processes and internal controls. In 2021, the first circular store in the country opens, in Rio de Janeiro, which aligns circularity with digital transformation, to create a unique experience for customers (RI – Lojas Renners, 2022).

4. Results and Discussion

4.1. Narrative Review of Literature - NRL - Article Analysis

In the analysis, the Google Scholar and ScienceDirect databases were chosen using as keywords “Retail Market” AND “Innovation” AND “Consumer Experience” restricting the results to the last five using the Publish or Perish software as support.

Table 2. Distribution of Publications by Database.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Database</th>
<th>Total Publications</th>
<th>Total Citations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Google Scholar</td>
<td>590</td>
<td>3239</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Crossref</td>
<td>1000</td>
<td>3793</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>1590</td>
<td>7032</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: The authors, 2022.

When performing the search in the databases, the following quantities of publications were returned, which determine the number of publications and citations, Table 2. The steps provided for in the PRISMA-P protocol, which are: Identification, screening, eligibility and documents, also made it possible to build a flowchart of the selection process of scientific publications, Table 5.

After the last filtering, the ten most relevant articles of the last five years were identified, as shown in tables 3 and 4.
Table 3. Selection of Articles By Area, Title, Authors, Citations and Year.

### Google Scholar Database

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Journal</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Authors</th>
<th>Number of Citations</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Web Address</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

### Cross Ref Database

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Journal</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Authors</th>
<th>Number of Citations</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Web Address</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Source: The Authors, 2022.

The following is a brief summary of the abstracts of the articles in order to better detail the searches for the researched articles and the understandings about them according to Table 4.

The six selected articles provide insights into Multichannel Retail, Omnichannel and innovation, presenting concepts and future market trends. In the next stage of the research, the articles will be analyzed in depth in order to extract know-how about the knowledge covered.

### 4.1.1. Comparative Analysis - Viability of Companies

At this stage, it was analyzed which of the innovations are viable to be implemented in small and medium-sized companies in the same field that do not have low capital to invest, Table 5.
Table 4. a brief Summary of the Abstracts of the Articles

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Summary of the objective, methodology and results obtained</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Consumer decision-making in Omnichannel retailing: Literature review and future research agenda</td>
<td>The purpose of this article is to provide a comprehensive and concise review of the literature on omnichannel retailing. The current study is built on a review of a total of 131 research articles in the Web of Science database between January 2011 and April 2020. We conclude that it is important to consider consumer responses using the cognitive model-affective-conative to advance our understanding of consumer decision making in the omnichannel customer journey.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Effect of multichannel service delivery quality on customer’s continued engagement intention: A customer experience perspective</td>
<td>The purpose of this article is to examine the relationships between multi-channel service delivery quality (MSDQ), customer experiences, ongoing engagement intentions, and customer engagement. The results of the analysis suggest that MSDQ positively impacts customer experiences, which in turn influences their intentions for continued engagement. Additionally, the analysis found that customer engagement positively moderates the effects of MSDQ on customer experiences.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Omnichannelling and the Predominance of Big Retailers in the post-Covid Era</td>
<td>The Covid 19 pandemic has profoundly affected the competitive context of retail companies. Multiple changes have taken place in both consumer behavior, retail strategy and marketing channels. Some cases confirm the acceleration of the integration and redefinition of the roles of physical and online channels. Major retailers strengthen their dominance in global markets. Smaller operators could renew their role by shaping new forms of collaboration to survive.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Cross Ref Database

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Summary of the Objective, Methodology and Results Obtained</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Who is innovating? An exploratory research of digital technologies diffusion in retail industry</td>
<td>The objective of this study is to investigate the real level of diffusion of these technologies to understand the effective response of retailers. The results provide an overview of current innovation adoption strategies in terms of innovation diffusion and the main digital technologies adopted by different retail categories considering store size and typology. Finally, the Retailing Innovation Market framework is proposed as a match between the actual technological supply and the retailer's demand.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Emerging theories of consumer-driven market innovation, adoption, and diffusion: A selective review of consumer-oriented studies</td>
<td>In this study, we advocate a redefinition of the consumer's role in market innovation and suggest new patterns of consumer adoption and diffusion of market innovations.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>New retail versus traditional retail in e-commerce: channel establishment, price competition, and consumer recognition</td>
<td>In this article, we present a duopoly model composed of a new retail company and an online company, which sell the same product in two periods. The two companies compete for market share using behavior-based pricing (BBP), which means that in the second period each company offers different prices to consumers with different purchasing histories/behaviours in the first period. Under certain conditions, the new retail company will establish an offline channel with higher annoyance cost, which is a measure to facilitate consumers' access to offline stores, in the BBP model. Source: The Authors, 2022.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 5. Main Strategies and Innovations of the Companies analyzed.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Company</th>
<th>Innovation / Competitive Differential</th>
<th>Small Companies</th>
<th>Medium Companies</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pão de Açúcar Group</td>
<td>Self Checkout System</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Loyalty and Discount Program</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Digital Experience unifying digital and physical store experience.</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Sim</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Purchase in physical store, with deliveries in up to 4 hours) and Click &amp; Collect (online purchase and pick up in physical store).</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Partially</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Launches new own exclusive products</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Vertical vegetable garden inside the supermarket that offers fresher vegetables.</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>100% biodegradable packaging.</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Launch of the Factory dedicated to the production of artisanal beers.</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Subscription program allowing unlimited purchases during the month for a fixed amount.</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>GPA Log: The Group's logistics company.</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Renner Shops</td>
<td>Fashion Delivery: A solution that uses big data and artificial intelligence to bring a selection of products to your consumers' homes.</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Other service channels: The company also sells via Whatsapp, in which both artificial intelligence and an attendant are present, who are available to answer questions or help with purchases, either by indicating a part or sending images of products that the customer wishes to view.</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Digital Wallet allows the customer to experience self-service. The customer himself, with his cell phone, scans the clothing code and makes the payment. The employee's participation is only to take out the QR Code of the parts and deliver the products in the bag so that he can take the products home. All the products in the stores already have RFID, which facilitates the counting of stock, security and allows that, until the end of the year, the customer can pay and leave the store without interacting with an employee.</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Drive-thru shopping</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Live shop, digital sales channel through social medias.</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

5. Final Considerations

In view of this research and analysis, it is clear that a strategic management of innovation in retail makes all the difference when it comes to growth and development of a company. The objectives of this research were achieved by demonstrating the increase in commercial efficiency of retailers that use multichannel, omnichannel system and online marketing. It is clear that the retail innovation strategy is endless and of fundamental importance for the economic and sustainable health of a company.

The limitations of this work were given to companies that do not opt for multichannel, omnichannel systems and online sales because they point to a lack of investments and conditions to adapt to the new retail model.

As the main contribution of this study is to expand the knowledge about the omnichannel process, multichannel as an innovation strategy in retail where it was found that several innovations adopted by large retailers are viable and low cost to be implemented in small and medium companies in the field, helping its survival and permanence in the market.

Finally, this article is a starting point in the construction of a solid conclusive technical report that will bring insights to retail market managers and scholars in the area in order to support new studies and decisions of these managers.

References:


